EDCI 698: Conducting Research on Teaching  
Dr. Linda Valli  (Office: 2304B Benjamin)  
Phone: 301/405-8157  
Office Hours: Before/after class & by appt.

Teacher Leadership Program  
LRV@umd.edu  
Meet: Room 3315 Benjamin  
Tuesdays 4:30-7:15

Fall Semester Meeting Dates:  

Course Overview  
This is a two-semester course, with one credit in the fall and two credits in the spring. The course continues the focus on studying one's own teaching practice, and being agents of change, begun in the first semester of the Teacher Leadership program. We will continue to draw on National Board standards as a framework to guide our research and reflections on practice:

- understanding students, subject matter, curriculum, assessments, & the learning environment (NB 1, 2, 3; CF- Knowledge of Pedagogy, Learners, Curriculum, Educational Goals and Assessment, Social and Cultural Contexts, and Technology)
- respecting diversity and encouraging family involvement (NB 1 & 5; CF- Knowledge of Learners, Social and Cultural Contexts)
- using a rich variety of instructional resources and strategies (NB 1, 2, 3; CF- Knowledge of Pedagogy, Curriculum, Educational Goals and Assessment, and Technology)
- encouraging multiple paths to learning (NB 1, 2, 3 & 4; CF- Knowledge of Pedagogy, Learners, Curriculum, Educational Goals and Assessment, and Technology)
- developing professional relationships (NB 5; CF- Knowledge of Pedagogy, Learners, Curriculum, Educational Goals and Assessment, Social and Cultural Contexts, and Technology)
- engaging in reflective practice (NB 4; CF- Knowledge of Pedagogy, Learners, Curriculum, Educational Goals and Assessment, Social and Cultural Contexts, and Technology)

These standards are consistent with the goal of all teacher preparation programs at UMCP to prepare reflective practitioners for a pluralistic society through research-based inquiry. In this course, we will explicitly reflect on the cultural aspects of schools and teaching practice by using the Cultural Inquiry Process. We will closely examine our own beliefs about teaching and learning, how beliefs are culturally embedded, if they are supported by research, and if our teaching practices match our beliefs about teaching.

The class will be in the form of a seminar in which you regularly present your ideas about the readings, research on teaching, and your teacher research projects. You may conduct your teacher research assignments alone, with other members of the class, or with other professional colleagues. Your project can focus on your classroom or be a school-level change effort. You might even involve your students in your research!

Specifically, the course is designed to

- deepen and broaden your understandings of teacher research and the Cultural Inquiry Process
- help you generate ideas for teacher research: examining your own beliefs,
assumptions, and teaching approaches as well as the social context of teaching

• guide you in exploring relevant scholarship and research to inform your work
• give you opportunities to practice various types of data collection, including fieldnotes and reflective journal writing
• culminate in a research project, paper, and presentation.

By the end of the spring semester, you will have written a paper worthy of submission to a professional conference or journal and a capstone requirement for your masters degree. This final paper is the equivalent of your masters thesis and is formally submitted for the Dean’s approval. Throughout the course, other students, school staff and I will provide guidance in the action research process.

---

**The act (of teacher research) is addictive.**

The habit of asking one’s own questions and then reorganizing the classroom in order to search for answers is irresistible.

Nor can the ‘What will happen if we...?’ be kept the private domain of the teacher. Children are quick to perceive that school has become a place where people learn to move with the flow of their own questions.

It is an intellectually and emotionally charged drama...

---

**Vivian Paley (1997)**

---

**In virtually every instance in which researchers have examined the factors that account for student performance, teachers prove to have a greater impact than program...**

**There is an enormous amount of evidence that teachers have a significant impact on efforts to change schools and on the nature of the students’ experience, whatever the formal policies and curricula of the school or classroom might be.**

---

**Hawley & Rosenholtz (1984)**

---

**Required Texts:**

Cultural Inquiry Process Website (http://classweb.gmu.edu/cip/cip-ind.htm)

Additional Readings as assigned (see below).
**Tentative Class Schedule & Assignments**

To prepare for class discussions, keep a notebook on readings. For the Mills chapters, jot down the most important thing you learned and some questions the reading provoked. The questions at the end of the chapters are a helpful review. From the teacher research examples, consider what you would want to emulate and where you see room for improvement. At times, I might distribute additional guidelines for readings and assignments in class or through our Blackboard site. Check regularly.

**Session 1  What is Teacher Research? What is the Cultural Inquiry Process?**

**Sept 11**  
Read: Mills--Chapter 1 and at least one of these websites:  
http://gse.gmu.edu/research/tr/  
http://www.emtech.net/actionresearch.htm  
http://swearencenter.brown.edu/Literacy_Resources/inquiry.html  
http://www.lupinworks.com/ar/index.html  
http://www.teacherresearch.net/  

*Assignment: Before you start reading, write the answer to the question: "What is Teacher Research?" After you read & explore a website, write the answer to the same question and see if your understanding has changed. Then answer: How is the Cultural Inquiry Process similar to and different from Teacher Research? (To answer that question, explore this website: http://classweb.gmu.edu/cip/index.htm).*

**Session 2  What are the Key Steps and Concepts in the Cultural Inquiry Process?**

**Sept 18**  

*Assignment: Be prepared to discuss*
- How CIP compares to your experience with and understanding of teacher research
- How the four concepts—“cultural meanings & behaviors, context, social structure, and power”—can help you better understand what is happening in your schools and classrooms
- A concrete example from your personal experience as a student where one of the four concepts above might have shaped who you are as a teacher
- A possible teacher research project that is informed by one or more of these concepts

*Bring: CIP Form from Blackboard course site (Classroom Handouts).*

**Session 3  What is a Good TR Questions? How do I Collect Data?**

**Oct 9**  
Read: Mills Chapter 2 (pp. 23-30), Chapter 3  
Scheideman, Writing checklists: Empowering students to succeed

*Be prepared to discuss*
- Mills Ch. 2: What are characteristics of good research questions?
- Scheidemann: What are her research questions? Which of the data collection strategies in Mills Ch 3 does she use? Although it’s not articulated, how does culture function in this situation?

*Bring: Write 5 research questions you might be interested in studying.*

*Due Oct 13: Research Questions (Submit to Blackboard “Assignments”)*
Session 4  Collecting Data cont; How Do I Plan my Teacher Research?
Oct 23  Read:  Mills Chapter 2 (pp. 28-45)
       Cochran-Smith/Lytle journal excerpt
       Bogdan & Biklen (1998). The content of fieldnotes

Be prepared to discuss
• How will you plan your TR? Review Scheideman—how did she plan?
• What data collection strategies will help clarify your puzzlements?
• What do the articles add to your understanding of fieldnotes & journals
  (“Experiencing”)? How will you keep your journal & fieldnotes?

Bring (paper or electronic)
• Journal/Fieldnote forms from Blackboard course site (Classroom Handouts)

Due Oct 27:  Teacher Research Plan (Submit to Blackboard “Assignments”)

Session 5  Collecting data; Examining instructional contexts & artifacts
Oct 30  Read:  Jacob et al. One student at a time. . .

Be prepared to discuss
• Issues of instructional contexts & artifacts you see in this article; have you had similar
  puzzlements about students?

Bring
• Interview Guidelines from Blackboard course site (Classroom Handouts)

Due Nov 3:  Journal/Fieldnote Sample

Session 6  Collecting Data; Examining cultural meanings & behaviors
Nov 13  Read:  Paley, On listening to what children say

Be prepared to discuss
• Issues of cultural meanings & behaviors you see in this article
• How Paley collects and uses data

Due Nov 17:  Interview or Document Analysis (Submit to Blackboard “Assignments”)

Session 7  Collecting Data & Exploring Cultural Concepts, cont.
Nov 27  Read:  Heaton, Learning to hear voices: Inventing a new pedagogy

Be prepared to discuss
• Have you had an experience in rethinking teaching like this? Would you want to?
• What kinds of cultural components might Evelyn Jacob see in this example?

Bring
• Lit Review handout from Blackboard course site (Classroom Handouts).
• A draft of 5 Annotated References
• Progress Report Checklist from Blackboard course site (Classroom Handouts).
**Session 8** Collecting Data & Exploring Cultural Concepts cont.

**Dec 11** Read: McKay, Real magic: Trusting the voice of a young learner
                    Gitlin, A community of learners: Developing student voice

Be prepared to discuss
- The two forms "Enquiring (asking) and "Examining" (looking at artifacts, written materials, student work, etc.). How are these modes of data collection used in these teacher research examples?
- What kinds of cultural components might Evelyn Jacob see in these examples?
- Your Progress Report

Due Dec 15: Teacher Research Progress Report (Submit to Blackboard “Assignments”)

**Session 9** Designing & Planning Research cont.

**Spring Semester** Read:  Mills, Ch. 6
                    Clifford & Friesen, A curious plan: Managing on the twelfth

Be prepared to discuss
- How is TR planning similar/different in the Reston (in Ch. 6) and Clifford/Friesen examples?
- What kinds of cultural components might Evelyn Jacob see in “Curious Plan”?

Due Jan XX: Teacher Research Progress Report (Submit to Blackboard “Assignments”)

**Session 10** Validity, Reliability, & Generalizability

**TBA** Read: Mills Chapter 4 (pp.75-90)
                    Cone, Appearing acts: Creating readers in a high school English class.

Be prepared to discuss
- What is meant by validity, reliability & generalizability in TR. What are different ways of thinking about these ways of making sure your research is trustworthy?
- What are some ways that Cone gives you confidence in her research? Any weaknesses?

Bring
- Validity Frameworks from Blackboard course site (Classroom Handouts).

**Session 11** Validity Revisited & Research Ethics

**TBA** Reading: Mills Ch. 4 (pp. 90-96),
                    Hopkins, Validity Handout
                    Sylvester, Elementary school curricula and urban transformation.
http://www.aera.net/about/policy/ethics.htm
http://gse.gmu.edu/research/tr/TRissues.shtml

Be prepared to discuss
- What does Hopkins add to your understanding of validity in TR?
- What are some ways that Sylvester gives you confidence in her research? Any weaknesses?
- How will you establish research trustworthiness? Ensure that your study meets ethical standards? Do you think the studies we’ve read have been ethical?
**Session 12 Analyzing Data**  
TBA  
Read: Mills Chapter 5;  
Headman, Parents and teachers as co-investigators.

*Be prepared to discuss*  
- Mills suggestions for analyzing data  
- Ways in which Headman analyzes data;  
- How you might analyze your data  
- How analysis relates to validity and reliability

**Session 13 Examining Cultural Meanings; Analyzing Data (Cont.)**  
TBA  
Read: Ballenger, Because you like us: The language of control  
Reardon, Putting reading tests in their place.

*Be prepared to discuss*  
- Cultural components Jacobs might see in these articles  
- How the authors analyze their data

*Bring:* Audit Trail: Data Folders/Sources

**Session 14 Writing-up and Displaying Data**  
TBA  
Read: Mills Chapter 8, Appendices A & B  
Gallas, Arts as epistemology: Enabling children to know what they know

*Be prepared to discuss*  
- Mills suggestions for writing up and displaying data  
- Types of data display in the Gallas article  
- How you will display your data

*Time for peer coaching*

**Session 15 Teacher Research Presentations**  
TBA  
Submit: Teacher Research Paper (Date: __)

---

**Course Requirements & Grades**  
*Grades* will be based on the following assignments & point system:  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A+</td>
<td>100+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>96-100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A-</td>
<td>90-95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B+</td>
<td>87-89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>83-86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B-</td>
<td>80-82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C+</td>
<td>77-79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>73-76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C-</td>
<td>70-72</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*A+ is earned by achieving 100 pts, making an extraordinary contribution to class, and helping your peers with their Teacher Research ideas.*
### Assignment Due Dates

**Fall Semester**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assignment</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Due Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Class participation</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>Ongoing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question Assignment</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>Oct 13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Research Plan</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>Oct 27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal/Fieldnote Sample</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>Nov 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview or/Document Analysis</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>Nov 17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Research Progress Report</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>Dec 8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Semester 2**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Assignment</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Due Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Class participation</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>Ongoing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annotated Bib (10 source minimum)</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>Jan ___</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Data Folder/Sources</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>Due ___</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Draft of Final Paper</td>
<td>10% optional</td>
<td>Due ___</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Coaching</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>Due ___</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presentation</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>Due ___</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Final Paper</td>
<td>25/35%</td>
<td>May ___</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**Participation (NBPTS 5 Learning Community Member)**

Active participation in each session is essential. If you are prevented from doing so, please let me know (preferably in advance) so arrangements can be made for you to make up the work for that day's class. Please post your reflections on readings on the discussion board if you are absent, so your voice can still be part of the day’s conversation. Whenever feasible, do that prior to the class meeting.

Because the program is a cohort-based learning community, it is also important that you are prepared to share your insights, questions, and projects each time we meet. Full participation credit will be given for on-time arrivals and substantive contributions from readings and assignments to class discussions. Please inform me if you have a documented disability that would require any course accommodations.

**Research Question Assignment** (Due Oct 13)

Prepare a 2-3 page description of your research question, relevant context information, how you decided on the question, what you plan to do, what kinds of data you plan to collect, and how you anticipate it will benefit both your school and your teaching.

Since teacher research involves better understanding as well as change, you should develop two kinds of questions: “I wonder why. . .(understanding)” and I wonder how I can. . . (or) what would happen if. . .” (action). Begin with a general explanation of your puzzlement or area of interest that ends with a “wonder why” question. Once you have explored and selected a reasonable explanation, you are ready to state your action question. Also explain how your research question meets criteria for good questions we’ve discussed in class. Steps 1 and 2 of the Cultural Inquiry Process as well as Mills, Chapter 2 (pp. 25-28) will be helpful. Think of this as the beginning of your final paper.

---

* Each of these assignments enacts NBPTS 4: Teachers Think Systematically about Their Practice and Learn from Experience; as well as each category of the CoE’s Conceptual Framework- Knowledge of Pedagogy, Learners, Curriculum, Educational Goals and Assessment, Social and Cultural Contexts, and Technology
**Teacher Research Plan: Due Oct 27**
Your plan should be at least 5-6 pages. It will build on your RQ assignment and should be written as the start of your final paper (for which you’ll have the change verb tense from future to past). Literally, describe what you are planning to do: what is your puzzlement, focus, question; your rationale for pursuing this project; theory/research base (at least a beginning), (anticipated) action, participants/negotiations, data collection sources & strategies, timeline, resources needed. Also, try to anticipate any obstacles or glitches to your plan and adjustments you might make.

You might begin with an “anecdote” or event that expresses your core passion and draws your reader into your paper. This is often the original situation (baseline) that caused the puzzlement. Explain what you were seeing, hearing, experiencing that made you think this focus was important. Describe what you will be doing and how you will monitor changes in your own teaching practices, orientations and/or beliefs. “Who, what, when, where, why, and how” should be clear. Include a description of characteristics of your school, assignments, and students that are relevant to your project. Explain how you decided on this project and your research question, and how you anticipate it will benefit the school. The CIP Steps can guide you, as well as Mills, Chapter 2.

**Journal/Fieldnote Example: Due Nov 3**
Journals and fieldnotes are the staple of qualitative and teacher research. There are several different ways these can be written. The assignment should be 5-6 typed pages. In this assignment, you might describe and analyze a puzzlement about one particular student or small group of students, pay particular attention to cultural meanings, behaviors, artifacts, and instructional context, generate questions, or reflect on readings. Your submission must contain evidence of both observation and reflection. See guidelines on ELMS Class Handout site.

**Interview or Document Analysis: Due Nov 17**
Students will have the option of conducting an informal interview, a formal interview, distributing a questionnaire or survey, combining informal questioning with analysis of student work, or doing a document analysis. Specific guidelines will be discussed. The assignment should be 5-6 typed pages. See guidelines on ELMS Class Handout site.

**Teacher Research Progress Report: Due Dec 15**
Teacher Research progress paper and anticipated data collection instruments. This should be at least 10 pages long (typed, double-spaced, following APA format). In an appendix, include any data collection instruments/materials you plan to use. The paper should explain what you have done so far and what you plan to do next semester. In one or other of those sections, be sure you describe your research question, rationale/lit review, various types of data, and data collection strategies, and partial bibliography. This should build on your TR Plan, changing future tense to present or past tense where appropriate. Next semester you will build on this report, writing about data analysis procedures, validity checks, findings, and ethical precautions you have taken to safeguard your students and others. This progress report will develop into your final paper for the Spring Semester.

**Annotated Bibliography: Due Jan**
An annotated bibliography of at least 10 sources related to your project in APA style. Sources need to inform the topic you have selected; they can be a combination of traditional and teacher research. Annotations should be two paragraphs long. The first paragraph should summarize and
evaluate the source; the second paragraph should describe its relevance to your project. You can use Mills and other class resources in your final paper bibliography, but not this assignment. These should be additional sources. These sources will be incorporated into your final paper. See Mills and University Library link for APA format.

**Audit Trail: Data Folder/Sources** (Due Session 13)
Keep data in a 3 ring binder, accordion folder, or other format organized chronologically by type of data. This serves as your audit trail. Bring it to class for discussion and peer review on April 1. Also bring a one page summary of your audit trail: the types of data, why you collected them, and how you will analyze. (Mills Figure 3-4, p. 73 in 2nd edition is a possible chart, but add analysis). Submit the one page summary to Blackboard Assignments by _____.

**Draft to Peer Coach** (Due….)
Make as much progress on your paper as possible. Indicate what you still need to do as well as what you’ve already done. You can highlight the “to do” sections with a different color or font. This will be submitted to your peer coach through the Discussion Board (start a new forum by clicking top-left). Follow the Peer Coaching Guide and Writing Guidelines for assistance.

**Peer Coaching Feedback** (Due….)
Use the Discussion Board to provide feedback to your partner as soon as possible. Full points will be given by (a) giving comments and doing editing in the text (you can use the tracking function, but don’t need to), and (b) using the peer coaching guide to summarize feedback. If you exchange paper copies, be sure that I see the editing you have done. The peer coaching guide will ALSO be submitted in Assignments so you can be graded.

**Edited Draft (Optional)** (Due…..)
Once you get peer feedback, make the changes you deem necessary. If you want feedback from me at this point, submit this version on Blackboard Assignments for grading and feedback. This is an optional 10 point assignment. If you do not submit a draft for my feedback, your final paper will count for 30 (instead of 20) points.

**Final Paper** (May …..)
Submit an electronic copy on Blackboard Assignments by May 17 for grading. Once you receive feedback, make any suggested and submit a paper copy to me for the Dean’s approval as your non-thesis option paper—one of the essential graduation requirements. The official cover sheet must be used. You can either mail me the paper or bring it to campus during the first summer session. Follow Writing Guidelines, Peer Coaching Guide, and peer/instructor feedback you received. This assignment will be worth 30 points (or 20 if you submitted a draft for 10 points).

**Presentation** (May…..)
Guidelines are in Course Handouts. For your presentation have a one page handout to give members of your small group. Six should be sufficient. I will distribute some examples in advance for you to see. Turn in your one page handout to Assignments by May 19 for grading.
Assigned Readings


Jacob, E. et al. (1996, March). One student at a time: The cultural inquiry process, Middle School Journal, 29-35.


General Instructional Policies

Religious Holidays. The University System of Maryland policy (Assignments and Attendance on Dates of Religious Observance) provides that students should not be penalized because of observances of their religious beliefs; students should be given an opportunity, whenever feasible, to make up within a reasonable time any academic assignment that is missed due to individual participation in religious observances. It is the student’s responsibility to inform the instructor as soon as possible of any intended absences for religious observances. Additional information on this policy may be found at http://www.president.umd.edu/policies/iii510a.html.

Code of Academic Integrity and Plagiarism. All students are expected to abide by the code of academic integrity throughout this course and all other courses offered at the University of Maryland. Academic dishonesty, including cheating, fabrication, and plagiarism will not be tolerated and will be reported to the Student Honor Council. The full text of the University’s honor code is available at http://www.studenthonorcouncil.umd.edu/code.html. Students, who have questions about the code, or their obligations under the code, should contact the student honor council chair at HonorCouncil@umd.edu. Information on plagiarism can be found at: http://www.lib.umd.edu/guides/citing.html

Documented Disabilities. A student with a documented disability or any other special need who wishes to discuss academic accommodations should contact the instructors as soon as possible. The University is obligated, whenever possible, to provide appropriate accommodations for students with disabilities. Students who have questions about their rights or accommodations may contact Disability Support Services (4-7682).

Course Evaluation: As a member of our academic community, you as a student have a number of important responsibilities. One of these responsibilities is to submit your course evaluations each term though CourseEvalUM in order to help faculty and administrators improve teaching and learning at Maryland. Please make a note now of the dates for Fall 2012 (Tues, Nov 27 - Wed, Dec 12) and the link at which you can access the submission system (www.courseevalum.umd.edu). If you submitted all of your evaluations in the fall or are a new student, you can also access all posted results from Fall 2008 forward via Testudo under CourseEvalUM Reporting. To retain this access, you must submit all of your evaluations each semester. If you do not have access right now, you can gain it by submitting past evaluations. More information is at: https://www.irpa.umd.edu/Assessment/CourseEval/stdt_faq.shtml.
TITLE OF THE PAPER

by

Student’s Name

(UID Number)

(Advisor’s Name)

Report submitted to Professor __________
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Education

I recommend that this paper be accepted as a seminar paper
required for the Master of Education degree.

Professor Directing Seminar Paper Signature       Date

Advisor Signature                                  Date

Associate Dean for Graduate Studies Signature     Date

HONOR PLEDGE
I pledge on my honor that I have not given or received any unauthorized assistance
on this assignment.

Student Signature                                Date
# 698 FINAL PROJECT EVALUATIVE CHECKLIST

Student: ____________________________  Evaluator: ____________________________

## Learning Outcome 1: Students will demonstrate the ability to engage in disciplined inquiry on their own practice and on instructional issues.

### Course Objectives Evaluated:
1. To become familiar with prevalent research models that inform study and understandings of teaching practice
2. To become more knowledgeable of the variety of research approaches that have been employed to study teaching and learning
3. To engage in critical discussion and analysis of education research on teaching
4. To learn to read, think and write like a professional engaged in teacher research

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Focus</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>4 Clear, consistent &amp; convincing evidence</th>
<th>3 Clear evidence</th>
<th>2 Limited evidence</th>
<th>0-1 Little or no evidence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Designing a research question</strong></td>
<td>▪ The paper introduces the question or issue that is to be explored</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ The paper narrows the question enough to be addressed adequately in the presentation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ The paper explains the question clearly</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ The paper explains why the question is relevant or provides some context for why it is important to pursue</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Choosing relevant literature</strong></td>
<td>▪ The literature that the paper references is relevant—the works cited address the question</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ The work that the paper cites is work that is considered to be seminal and foundational in the area (e.g., from reputable outlets; from peer-reviewed journals; works that are cited frequently; etc.)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Study design</strong></td>
<td>▪ The paper uses methods that are appropriate to explore the question</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ The paper describes the key assertions (e.g., findings, arguments, implications, etc.) developed in his/her study</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ The paper supports the assertions with data assembled</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ The data possess sufficient validity and reliability</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ The data triangulate sufficiently around the assertions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ The paper integrates interpretations into a well developed purpose for the study</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ The paper describes the limitations of the study, draws conclusions from the data, relates them back to the research question, and discusses implications of the study</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Conventions</strong></td>
<td>▪ The paper is written in a style appropriate for graduate-level presentation and publication</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cohesion</strong></td>
<td>▪ The paper addresses important and interesting issues that were framed at the outset of the presentation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ The argument(s) is developed thoroughly</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>▪ The paper has a logical and coherent flow</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comments:**

---

13